

ПРАВООЗАЩИТНЫЙ ЦЕНТР "МЕМОРИАЛ"

MEMORIAL HUMAN RIGHTS CENTER

127051, Россия, Москва, Малый Каретный пер., д. 12

Тел. +7 (495) 225-3118

Факс +7 (495) 624-2025

E-mail: memhrc@memo.ru

Web-site: <http://www.memo.ru/>



Ingushetia: new methods of counter-terror

Licence to kill?

«Due to the fact that we should stop, let's say, the existence of militants in the Republic of Ingushetia, we have already rubbed three of them out in the outhouse, in the words of President Vladimir Vladimirovich.

Now the counter-terrorist operation is being conducted on the territory of the Republic of Ingushetia with the sanction of the President of the Russian Federation. The existence of militias - is it not an excuse? They kill civilians here, Russians, Koreans, Ingush are killed by militants. And we decided to answer the same. No we, but rather the President of the Russian Federation Putin. "

Piotr Pronko, press secretary of USB for RI during the interview to the radio station "Echo of Moscow", on February 2, 2008.

On August 2, 2008 in Pliyevsk's municipality of the city of Nazran, officers of the Russian Ministry of the Interior were attacked. As a result, two policemen were injured. The place of the attack and also adjacent streets were blocked by officers of the security services. One hour later, when two local residents, **Khamzat Izmailovich Gardanov**, born in 1978 and **Daoud Magomedovich Chibiev**, born in 1982, arrived there, officers of the security forces shot them both. According to eyewitnesses, after verification of documents, one of the soldiers opened destruction fire on them. Frightened, Gardanov and Chibiev tried to fled, but they came under dense fire, including from the near located armored personal carrier. Gardanov died on-site, and the corpse of Chibiyev was found in a nearby garden the next day.

It was not accidental.

Since a year and a half a new stable trend has been observed in Ingushetia: during the special operations officers of various security services open destruction fire on the suspects people. In most cases, eyewitnesses allege that the killed did not provide any resistance, but officers have not even tried to detain them. The present bulletin is dedicated to the extrajudicial executions during special operations, new method of "counter-terror" in Ingushetia and analyzes the reasons for its application and the complexity of the struggle against this flagrant violation of the human right to life.

According to the monitoring by "Memorial" *in 2007* during specials operations officers of the security agencies **killed 26 alleged participants in IAGs**. Only three of those killed, have apparently provided resistance. In other cases, there is reason to suggest that the suspects were killed during the simulation of a battle, or, like in the case of **Murat Bogatyrev**, after being detained. Perhaps at least yet another three people disappeared without a trace can be included to

the category of citizens, destroyed after their detention. They were abducted by unidentified armed men. According to available information, the abductees were killed by officers of the special unit deployed in the village of *Goyty of the Urus-Martan district of Chechnya*.

From January 2008 to August 5, 2008 26 people suspected of involvement in the IAGs have been killed during the special operations. According to the monitoring by "Memorial", at least twelve of them did not provide any armed resistance, they were not wanted and nobody of them was hiding from anybody (**J. M. Mutsolgov, R.M. Nalgiyev, Yu.A. Chapanov, R.M. Mutsolgov, Arsayev I.A., Ozdoyev M.L., Hadzhaev A.I., Aushev M. Kh., Pliyev M., Albakov L.B., Gardanov Kh.I, Chibiyev M.D.** - *see Annex*). Mikhail Ozdoyev was severely beaten after being detained, and he died in hospital a few days later. In two cases, together with resisting militants also their wives were killed (Madina Ausheva and Madina Pliyeva). The "siloviks" recognize these women if not as active participants of IAGs, then, in any case, as supporters of militants. Lidia Albakova, pensioner, a former teacher of Russian language, and her son, Adam Hadzhaev, have been killed because the alleged militants had been caught in their house. They were also classified as terrorists.

On February 4, 2008, yet another resident of Ingushetia, **Daud Hautiyev**, was abducted allegedly by officers of security services from the hospital in the city of Chegem of *Kabardino-Balkaria* (*see Annex*). As for **May 31, 2008** his whereabouts are unknown.

The special operations on destruction of the suspects are carefully planned, a dense cordon is posted around the zone of the event, the relatives, neighbors and local police officers are not allowed to approach. After the flagrant assassination of Apti Dalakov (*see Annex*), witnessed by dozens of refugees from the Prigorodny region of North Ossetia residing in the territory of the former kindergarten "Ryabinka", officers of security agencies watch especially carefully for limiting of access to the site of the operation. Many witnesses testified that they had seen the FSB officers planting a grenade on assassinated Dalakov. But, after repeated visits of "Ryabinka" by officers in civilian cloths the majority of witnesses refused to testify. Nevertheless, several witnesses are ready to confirm their testimony, both within the framework of possible criminal proceedings or in court, which enables to "Memorial" to demand the institution of criminal proceedings on the murder of Dalakov. In the prevailing in the republic climate of fear, only a few people are ready to testify against the actions of the FSB officially.

* * *

The "counter-terrorist operation" in the North Caucasus had a number of phases from extensive and open forms of violence to more hidden and difficult to document. Began in 1999 with massive indiscriminate bombing of settlements of Chechnya, the counter-terrorist operation (CTO) has developed in the form of large-scale "cleansing" (2000 - 2003) then moved to the "targeted special operations" in the Chechen Republic (2003 -), during which the detainees disappeared. Since 2003, the "targeted special operations", accompanied by enforced disappearances, started in Ingushetia. Since 2005, the abductees were more and more often discovered in temporary detention facilities some time after their abduction. The criminal cases were instituted against them subsequently. The given under torture testimony often become the unique proof of guilt of alleged member of the armed underground. Fabricate criminal cases - long process, which is working on an entire system of operational workers, investigators, some lawyers, judges and prosecutors inaction. The mechanism of fabricating criminal cases was described "Memorial" back in 2005, in the report "Conveyor Violence: human rights violations during counter-terrorism operations in the Republic of Ingushetia".

The falsification of criminal cases is a long process, for which an entire system of policemen, investigators, some lawyers, judges and inactive prosecution is working. The

mechanism of fabrication of criminal cases was described by "Memorial" already in 2005, in the report *"Conveyor of Violence: human rights violations during counter-terrorism operations in the Republic of Ingushetia"*.

The Methods of "counter-terror" and various forms of violence were changing both due to the new military tasks, and also and under the influence of critics of actions of "siloviks" by the Russian and international human rights community. The practice of abductions harmed so obviously the image of Russia that "siloviks" gradually began to refuse from it. Not only human rights activists opposed the fabrication of criminal cases in Ingushetia but also the more and more professional and courageous actions of lawyers who often managed to completely prove the failure of the charges, as well as the institute of jury trial. The jury trial in Ingushetia often justified the defendants in the cases related to participation in the armed underground. Knowing the brutal methods of inquiry and investigation, the jury carefully weighed the evidence of guilt of the defendant, not trusting only his "confessions", given at the phase of preliminary investigation.

The brought by jury acquittals annoyed the representatives both of Republican and federal authorities. The President of Ingushetia **M.M. Zyazikov**, the President of Russia **V.V. Putin** and the Deputy Prosecutor General of Russia **Nikolai Shepel** expressed against the application of the Institute of jurors in Ingushetia. The Prosecutor of R.I. Yu.N. Turygin lamented at a meeting with the representatives of "Memorial" in Nazran that a jury had acquitted seven "bandits" over a year.

However, the abolition of the jury trial is a serious political step, which the Russian authorities have not yet dared to do. Therefore, the "siloviks" find other ways to circumvent the decisions of this institution. Often, after the jury brought an acquittal, the released person is virtually immediately re-arrested. A new criminal case is initiated, and the case reaches trial again. **On February 2, 2006** officers of unidentified security services tried to detain **Murat Margoshvili**, acquitted by a jury, directly in the building of the Supreme Court of RI. After the reading of the verdict, when a judge released Margoshvili from detention, armed officers of security agencies, men of Slavic appearance, broke into the courtroom and intended to detain Margoshvili and his lawyer. By pure coincidence, the acquitted and his lawyer managed to leave the court building without being noticed.

The repeated criminal case can be brought on the episode that took place in the Chechen republic, where the jury trial did not operate. Thus, **Isropil Hayharoyev**, acquitted **on May 8, 2007** on all articles of charge (part 2 of the Art. 209, part 1 Art. 30, part 3 of Article. 205, part 1 of the Art. 30, part 3 of the Art. 206, part 3. of the Art. 222 of the CCRF), was re-abducted **on May 23, 2007**, immediately after he passed the course of treatment of kidneys in a hospital, that were beaten, during the preliminary investigation at the UBOP in Vladikavkaz., according to relatives. **Hayharoyev** was brought a new charge in connection with the attack on the village of *Roshni-Chu* of the Chechen Republic in 2005. In October 2007, a professional judge of the Supreme Court of CR **Alexandrov** condemned Hayharoev to 12.5 years of imprisonment. According to the lawyers, there was no evidence of guilt.

So, the detention of a suspect, the careful collection of evidence of guilt and the accusation in the clandestine armed activities, require much labor and professionalism of investigators. Otherwise, the cases are often failing in the courts, creating a new "problems" for the "siloviks" that are not ready to accept the decision of court as final. According to the "Memorial", for 2007, **27 detentions** of persons suspected of involvement in the IAGs, had been carried out. 3 of them were detained on suspicion of committing crimes under the part 1 of the Art. 126 of the CCRF and currently they are under investigation. 14 people were released. 1

person was acquitted in a court. 5 people were condemned to various terms of imprisonment (in 4 cases, the prisoners got minimal prison sentences). Others are under investigation. Thus, in **15 of 27 cases innocent people or those whose guilt was unable to prove, were detained.**

In 2008, on suspicion of involvement in IAGs, **6 people were arrested.** They all are released under a written undertaking not to leave the place. One of the released persons was killed during then special operation conducted by officers of UFSB. The Federal Center requires high percentage of solved criminal cases related to participation in the IAGs. Supposedly, the factor of poor quality of the investigative action is the main reason that officers of security agencies prefer to destroy the suspects during their detention and to "write off" their unsolved crimes on the destroyed. Often the destroyed people are in close kinship with famous militants. Apparently because of that they attract attention of the "siloviks".

* * *

The reason for the application of "new methods", perhaps, lies in another particular tactics of 'counter-terror' on the territory of RI. It is believed that the armed underground in Ingushetia is fed by non-traditional ideology of Islam, so-called Wahhabism. Indeed, many young people in Ingushetia are moving away from Sufi Tariqas and increasingly adopt the fundamental values of Islam. The state conducts the struggle against Wahhabism, replacing criminal and religious concepts: the counter-terror turns into a fight against the religion. As it is very difficult to condemn Wahhabists only for belonging to this current (the Constitution of RF guarantees freedom of religion), it is easier to destroy them on-site. In every district there are lists of "Wahhabists". Most destroyed during then detention young people over the past year and a half, as it turns out, practiced fundamental Islam.

An obvious example is the case of **Husen Mutaliyev**, shot **on March 15, 2007** in the courtyard of his house, immediately declared "ideological leader of illegal armed groups" by the law enforcement agencies of Ingushetia. At about 6 o'clock in the morning unidentified armed masked officers broke into the house of the Mutaliyevs located at the address: *city of Malgobek, 61, Kievskaya St.* They neither introduced themselves nor produced any documents, behaved very brutally. After searched the found nothing, they seized Husen Mutaliyev, took him away to the courtyard, brought to one of the cars and began to beat. Mutaliyev escaped and tried to flee. Officers opened destruction fire with automatic weapons on him. Husen fell, but he was alive. Injured, he was brought in the car "Volga", after which the unknown persons left. The next day, on March 16, the family Mutaliev was officially reported about the death of Husen and given the corpse from the morgue of Vladikavkaz. He was not delivered to the hospital.

In Malgobek's ROVD on the questions of relatives of the killed it was answered that Husen Mutaliev had been not wanted and there were no data on his links with militants. The Malgobeksk's Prosecutor's Office filed a criminal case on the murder of Mutaliyev under Article. 286 (excess of official authority), which was subsequently transferred to the Southern Federal District's Prosecutor's Office, and then dismissed "in the absence of crime in the act ". Earlier, on February 5, 2007, Husen Mutaliev has communicated with the Human Rights Center "Memorial". He asked for assistance in ensuring the personal safety and protection of his constitutional rights: *"They detained me in September 2006, beat and tried to force to assume a crime which I did not commit. Then they released me because they had nothing against me. But they continue to pursue me. After the assassination of a Mufti again I was called again to the police to testify. What should I do? I am ready to answer all questions, but if they treat me normally. All this because of I studied in Egypt, they pursued me because of this, I even don't go to the mosque anymore, because everyone who walks into a mosque is considered as Wahhabist",* - so Mutaliev explained his situation to the officers of HRC "Memorial". "So many

guys are like me, which are pursued for the fact that they are Muslims", - said Husen before leaving. He promised to return to the office of Human Rights Center "Memorial" together with friends that were also pursued on religious grounds. Young people were going to write a public statement that they are ready to answer the questions of authorities, but they require respect of their constitutional rights to freedom of religion.

A new trend in the conduct of special operations in Ingushetia causes anxiety. The entire republic instantly gets to know about questionable shootings during the detention. Now, almost no one believes to the official reports and press releases made by "siloviks". This only undermines further the already tiny legitimacy of State power in the republic, creates a feeling of legal insecurity of any resident (including children) and the orgy of the military clique.

It should be reminded that the mass protest in Nazran began just after the killing of six-year boy Rahim Amriyev by officers of security forces during special operations in the village of Chemulga in November 2007. In June 2008, a similar situation was avoided thank to pure chance.

In the evening of June 3, 2008 **Salman Mussaevich Hashagulgov**, resident of the village of Yandare, went by his car to the pasture in order to meet the domestic cattle. His son **A. Hashagulgov**, born in 1997, was together with him in the car. Arrived on the outskirts of the village, Hashagulgov Salaman heard something strike on the hood. He stopped the car and saw armed masked men dressed in camouflage uniforms. They opened aimed fire on the car. Salaman caught a white cloth, put a hand out of the window and started to swing shouting: "What do you do? I'm with a child! Do not shoot! ". After a while one of the soldiers shouted in reply: "All right, get out of the car and run to our side". When Salman and his son approached to them, officers searched them both and then the car. In doing so, they did not introduce themselves and did not show any documents. After being satisfied that the Hashagulgovs are peaceful people, "siloviks" released them with the words: "Consider that today is your birthday". Subsequently Salman Hashagulgov learned that officers of special services carried out special operations in the evening of June 3, in the area where he was fired. According to Salman, his son got a heavy psychological trauma and he still goes through a course of rehabilitation in the hospitals of the country.

Memorial does not question the need to combat illegal armed activities and terrorism but this struggle must be conducted in keeping with the Russian law and Russia's international obligations on human rights.

ANNEX

On February 7, 2007 at 15:25, in the city of Nazran *on Chechenskaya St.* officers of special services killed two residents of Ingushetia during a special operation: **Adam (Ibrahim) Izmailovich Gardanov**, born in 1985, resident of the village of Pliyevno at the address Gorchkhanov Street., 39 and **Magomed Bashirovich Chakhkiyev**, born in 1973, resided in the village of Nasir-Court, on Partizanskaya Street., 25.

Никакого вооруженного сопротивления ими оказано не было. Убитым были произведены контрольные выстрелы в голову.

According to eyewitnesses, at about 15.30, a car VAZ-21099, "asphalt" color, with tinted windows, registration number 064, stopped near the building of the administration of the Central Municipal District (CMD) of Nazran, facing the building of GIBDD of MVD of RI. Suddenly, this car was blocked from two sides with the minibus "gazelle", white, registration number S EX 930 06 and a car VAZ-2109, number P 105 MU 06 (or 95) region with chequered pattern of taxi on the roof (after the end of the "special operations" the chequered pattern was removed). More than 10 armed men in military uniforms and civilian clothes jumped out of the "Gazelle" and VAZ-2109 ("Taxi"). The witnesses described two of them. They said, one person, driver of the "Gazelle" had a Slavic appearance and wore a white tyubeteyka (fazik) on his head, the second had a solid body and Asian face's features. Exactly these people rushed to the first car – VAZ-21099 and opened fire on it with automatic weapons. Following them, another 2-3 "siloviks" opened fire on the car. The people being in the car were killed. There did not provided any armed resistance. "Siloviks" made proof shots on their heads.

4-6 Armored Personnel Carriers and 2-3 "Ural" cars carrying military officers arrived to the scene. After that, "siloviks" tied ropes in the necks of the killed, drugged them out from the cars and searched the corpses lying on the ground. In the eyes of many witnesses (the place where the events occurred, is usually crowded) "siloviks" the pockets of those killed and dragged away the money from them and took it. Some eyewitnesses claim that one of those killed allegedly had a "suicide belt". They saw siloviks to withdraw any object from his body, wrapped up in a bundle and blew up outside the administration of TSMO. Other witnesses claimed that the siloviks put something in the trunk of Gardanov's car, and then began to extract all of this out.

Later, law enforcement officers of Ingushetia arrived to the place of special operation. Subsequently, the «seized» of the car belongings were given to the Ingush police officers and prosecutors.

Two rings of cordons were put in the area of special operation: the first ring consisted of the participants of the special operation themselves (as it turned out later, officers of FSB), but local policemen were stood at some distance from them. Ingush policemen and prosecutors were not allowed to access directly to the site of the killing. 4 or 5 armored personnel carriers as well as several cars «Gazelle» carrying officers of security agencies were brought up to the *Chechenskaya street*.

Among other witnesses there were two young men that made a video of what happened. Apparently they were journalists-cameramen, because, after have seen them, the being there head of the press-service of the Ministry of the Interior of RI **Nazir Evloyev** gave an order to the Ingush policemen to take their camera away. But, the young people did not give them the camera.

Many of those who have witnessed the special operation, including law enforcement officers of Ingushetia, argue that the young people who were in the car could be detained alive.

Soon, the names of the killed people became known. One of them, resident of the village of *Plievo* **Ibrahim (Adam** on the passport) **Gardanov** was known that he treated people in non-traditional way (treatment with the help of Muslim prayers). According to some information, in 2006 officers of UFSB and of the mobile detachment of the Ministry of the Interior have twice broken into his home twice in order to conduct searches. One of the claims against Gardanov was made by officers of security services about his Muslim method of treatment. Gardanov was accused that he produced hypnosis and made influence to the people. Relatives did not confirm this information. According to them, officers of security services visited them during routine

checks of the passport regime in Plievo and asked about the Adam's activities because they saw, that he had to receive a large number of people.

The second killed was resident of the village of NASIR-Kort, Magomed Bashirovich Chakhkiyev. Gardanov was treating his wife, who suffered from a mental disease. On February 7, Chakhkiyev once again brought Gardanov to his home in order to make the next treatment session for his wife. The car by which they came, was bought by Gardanov from Chahkiyev in debt. A relative of Gardanov says that on that day Adam took with him the money in the amount of 70 000 rubles in order to pay for the car. According to relatives of Gardanov and Chahkiyev the money and two mobile phones were seized by officers of the security services.

On February 9, the press service of UFSB for RI Ingushetia distributed the reports on this special operation, which argued that «two bandits from the so-called «Nazran's terrorist group»: Chakhkiyev Magomed Bashirovich, born in 1973 and Gardanov Adam Izmailovich, born in 1985 were blocked in the city of Nazran near the building of the administration of the Central District on the Chechenskya St. These persons are reasonably suspected of committing a series of flagrant crimes in the North Caucasus, including the attempt on life of Hamkhoyev I.B., Mufti of the Republic of Ingushetia, firing of a convoy of the 126th Regiment of the Interior troops of Russia on the administrative border between North Ossetia and Ingushetia. The criminals traveled by a car VAZ-21099, provided armed resistance during their detention using small arms and improvised explosive devices. They were destroyed by counter fire. The law enforcement officers and civilians were not affected.

The following items were discovered at the scene and seized: 1 Makarov pistol and 10 cartridges to it, 4 improvised explosive device (the so-called "Ktattabka"), 1 grenade F-1, 1 anti-personnel mine.

On February 12, father of Adam Gardanov, **Gardanov Izmail** appealed to the office of HRC «Memorial» in the city of Nazran. He said in his written statement that his son had never been involved in unlawful actions, he had a peaceful lifestyle. **Izmail Gardanov** believes that his son had been killed without any justification, and requests to assist in restoring the good name of Adam and punishing the perpetrators involved in his killing.

On March 15, 2007 Husen Uvaysovich Mutaliyev was killed in the courtyard of his own home, and immediately declared by law enforcement agencies of Ingushetia «ideological leader of illegal armed groups».

At about 6 a.m. four vehicles carrying up to 25 masked officers of security structures arrived to the Mutaliyev's house located at the address: Malgobek city, Kievskaya street., 61. They broke into the house. «Siloviks» did not produce any documents, behaved very brutally and assaulted members of the family Mutaliyev. After have searched the house and found nothing, they seized **Husen Mutaliyev**, brought him into the courtyard, leaned against a cars and started to beat. Mutaliyev escaped and tried to flee. "Siloviks" opened fire on him with automatic weapons to kill. Husen fell, but he was still alive. Officers threw the injured into the car «Volga» and left. The brother of Husen, Hassan Mutaliyev, followed them by his car. The convoy of "siloviks" was stopped by officers GIBDD RI at the so-called «Kanytshevsky crossroads». «Siloviks» presented them the special pass (pass GrOU on the North Caucasus) and continued to travel in the direction of North Ossetia. But Hassan was stopped.

In the afternoon of the same day the website of the Interfax news Agency reported: " *The active participant of IAGs (Illegal Armed Groups) Hussein Mutaliev was destroyed by law enforcement officers of Ingushetia and North Ossetia during the special operation in Malgobek*

(Ingushetia), said on Thursday a source in the law enforcement services in Ingushetia to the agency «Interfax-South». "On Thursday afternoon in Malgobek Hussein Mutaliev, born in 1980, wanted on the federal level for abductions (Art. 126 CCRF), he offered armed resistance at the attempt of detention and tried to undermine a grenade. At that moment he was shot, at that it was managed to escape the explosion "- said the source.

According to the source, *«the injured militant was taken to the local hospital, where he died of his wounds. According to the interlocutor of Interfax, there was operative information, that H. Mutaliev was an ideological leader of the illegal armed groups that belonged to Wahhabists, as well as an active participant of the field commander Khasmagomed Bogatyrev's illegal armed group. In addition, he is suspected of participation in the attack on Ingushetia in June 2004.»*

The next day, **on March 16**, the Mutaliev's were officially informed about the death of Hussein and received his body from the morgue of *Vladikavkaz*.

In Malgobeksk's ROVD the questions of relatives of the murdered were answered that Husen Mutaliev was not wanted and there was no information about his links with militants. The Malgobek's Prosecutor's Office instituted a criminal case on the murder of H. Mutaliev on the Art. 286 (abuse of powers). Subsequently this case was transferred to the Southern Federal District's Prosecutor's Office, and then dismissed «in the absence of crime in the act».

On June 17, at about 7 a. m in the village of *Surhahi* FSB officers carried out another special operation. **Ruslan Khavazhevich Aushev**, born in 1980, residing at the address: *Aushev St., 28. was killed as a result.*

The press-services of the law enforcement agencies reported that during the special operations «one of the leaders of the Wahhabite's underground Ruslan Aushev was destroyed». According to the representative of UFSB for RI **Alexander Cherepanov**, R. Aushev was one of the organizers of the attack on Ingushetia on the night of 21 to 22 June 2004 and the terrorist attack in *Beslan* and he had been wanted by law enforcement agencies for a long time. Siloviks blocked him in the village of *Surkhahi*. *"The house, where, according to our operational information, this bandits hided, was taken into a dense cordon. The special police forces wanted to act without shelling and suggested the militant to surrender, but he opened fire. "* Then, in the words of Cherepanov, the special police forces opened heavy fire in response, but shooting from the house wasn't stopped because the gunman hided in a specially equipped and fortified place on the attic; finally, Aushev was killed.

Soon after the incident activists of HRC "Memorial" visited the scene, interviewed relatives, neighbors of R. Aushev and witnesses. The picture of events in *Surhahi* established as a result was in somewhat different from this one presented by A. Cherepanov.

Early in the morning the houses № 30 and № 28 on *Aushev St.* were blocked by around eighty security forces, most of them masked, came with two armoured personnel carrierarmoured personnel carriers, six minibuses «Gazel» and several passenger cars. People spoke only Russian, but some of them with a strong accent. "Siloviks" entered two houses.

Ruslan Aushev's family lived in the house № 28 and their relatives in the house № 30. According to the owner of the house № 30, **Isropil Abdul-Mazhitovich Aushev**, born in 1955, he was sitting in the yard and telling beads, when suddenly in the courtyard has appeared an armed men, climbed over the fence. They immediately aimed him with an arm, ordered to pull up the jacket, and to turn back to them. Only after that the house owner was asked who he was

and who were in the house. Isropil identified himself and said that there were only members of his family in the house. Pushing Isropil in the back with blow guns, soldiers entered the house following him and ordered all to go out. Together with Isropil in the house lived his sister **Khadizhat**, the nephew of **Magomed Osmanovic Aushev**, and **Michael Aushev** with his wife and six children. When they went out, everyone, including women and children, was put to a wall and searched. The men were separated and put down to earth faces down. Then, under the cover of Isropil, "siloviks" have carefully inspected the house, the attic and adjacent buildings, reporting after checking each of the rooms on the radio transmitter: "All clean." The search took for about one and a half hour, after that the main group of "siloviks" entered the yard.

Similarly it was searched the house № 28, owned by **Khavazh Khamoyevich Aushev**. At about 5:30 more than two dozen of "siloviks" surrounded his house and ordered the owner to go out. Havazh and his eldest son **Timur** left with raised hands. They were handcuffed and taken under the shed, put on the ground. « Women and children, were withdrawn from the house and taken to the neighbors', then the premises were thoroughly searched.

According to Aushev's family members, younger son of the owner, **Ruslan**, have for a long time lived here openly, and before June 17, before the Morning Prayer was also at home. But then he leaved for somewhere - Khavazh said she did not know where. It is clear that when the "siloviks" arrived, R. Aushev tried to hide, moving into the next door house to their relatives.

Why did he try to escape? It is likely that Ruslan Aushev could be linked to militants. However, as it turned out, the law enforcement authorities were not aware that R. Aushev was "wanted for a long time". In any case, according to all eyewitnesses, Aushev did not open fire nor provide any resistance.

On August 30 at about 16:20 **Islam Yusupovich Belokiev**, born in 1988, was killed in auto market at the municipality of *Nasyr-Kortsky of the city of Nazran*. News agencies immediately reported with reference to official sources that he was a gunman and killed during a special operation. The senior Assistant of the Prosecutor of RI Zinaida Tomova reported to RIA "Novosti" that Belokiev provided armed resistance during a special operation on his detention carried out by officers of the Centre "T" of MVD RF and UFSB of Ingushetia and was destroyed by counter fire. According to law enforcement officials, Belokiev was part of a gang of Adam Nalgiev, killed during a special operation in June 2006, involved in the subversive and terrorist acts and attacks on officers of FSB in Ingushetia. In addition, *in July 2007* Belokiev sticked leaflets with threats against the officers of the MVD RI in Nazran.

Activists of the HRC "Memorial" visited the scene of death of Belokiev and interviewed witnesses. As it reported sellers in the market of auto parts, Islam has traded road oils there for past two years together with their parents. His family rented an iron container № 12. Islam usually left for home after 15:00. This time, he closed the container and went to the exit from the market. He was hailed by people carried by the car VAZ-2110 parked under the willow outside the market. Islam turned in their direction, and then shots were heard. Numerous eyewitnesses claim that Islam Belokiev stood some time then slowly fell down to the ground. People beeing in the market rushed to the fallen man. Shooting people, among which there was a man of Slavic appearance dressed in sport cloths and jeans, trooped round still alive Islam and did not allow anyone to approach to him. Soon, a minibus "Gazel" arrived and got out from the scene. Soon, the special federal officials created a second ring cordon. Unlike the first ones, they were equipped in flak jackets, masks "scope" on their heads. Then soldiers came to the market by an armored personnel carrier. The young man had been still alive, at least, for forty minutes. Eyewitnesses say that from time to time he turned his head. "Siloviks", the number of which has reached 70-80 people, did not render assistance to him. Local policemen were not allowed to

approach. Witnesses claim that at this time a pistol and a grenade were planted on the fatally wounded man. "Siloviks" carried out it so openly, without any shy: they put a gun in the hands of Islam Belokiev and shot from it several times in the top. They searched Belokiev, found keys of a container and went to open it. "Siloviks" demanded the people to go away - supposedly there may be explosives in the container. The owner, who leased a container to Belokiev, said that there were no explosives. He took the keys, opened it himself, cautioning "siloviks" that they plant nothing illegal. A local policeman and the owner together went inside. Upon being satisfied that there was nothing in the container, "siloviks" went away.

After some time officers of Ingush prosecutor's office and physicians were allowed to approach to the scene but Islam Belokiev was already dead. The body was taken to the city's morgue and given to relatives subsequently. According to eyewitnesses, the killed has not provided any resistance. If desired, he could be easily arrested.

On September 27, in the village of *Sagopshi* during a joint special operation officers of both federal and republican security services killed two local residents, the brothers **Galaev: Said-Magomed Hasanovich**, born in 1983 and **Ruslan Hasanovich**, born in 1986, resided at the address: *Oskanova St., 77*.

On the same day, the press service of the Ministry of MVD RI said that "*... two militants had offered armed resistance and were destroyed in the course of special operation in the village Sagopshi. One of the destroyed is Said-Magomed Galaev (conspiratorial name is "Abdul-Malik"), a so-called "emir" of militants on Malgobeksky district of Ingushetia, "and one alleged participant of IAGs was arrested, and currently operational investigative activities are being conducted towards him. "As a result of the special operation two officers of UVD on the Kurgan region were injured with various degrees of gravity"* - told the press service¹.

On September 28, activists of HRC «Memorial» met with relatives of the killed in the village of *Sagopshi*. According to the dead's mother, **Fasimat Galaeva**, on the morning of last day, as the family respected Muslim Urazu post, they got up and had a breakfast before sunrise, and then dispersed to their rooms. Said-Magomed slept in a room together with his wife, **Madina**, another two brothers, Ruslan and **Tagir** (born in 1982), - in a separate room at the opposite side of the house, and the mother and younger son, **Said Ahmed**, eleven years old, - in a room near from the entrance door.

At About 6:30 officers of the security forces (more than 200 people) arrived to the Galaevs' home by two armored personnel carriers, a car "Ural" and ten armored UAZ. The house was blocked from all the sides; about fifty people entered the courtyard. Said-Magomed's wife noticed the military in the yard, and said it to her husband. Said-Magomed shouted to brothers that there were soldiers in the yard, and went to the entrance door. He did not have time to leave the room - the «siloviks» raided the house and opened fire deliberately. Magomed-Said and his brother Ruslan, also approaching to the entrance door, were killed. Woken up by sound of shots, Fasimat saw Ruslan, staggering, entered and fell near the bed. In another room her daughter-in-law, held by the military, was shouting. The woman, Said-Akhmed and Tagir were withdrawn in the street. In each room soldiers planted three grenades, and only after that they forced Tagir to drag out his killed brothers to the street. Women and children were put next to the bodies. According to Madina, then "a Russian military" came and asked her for a black bag. Madina said that there was no bag. The officer left the yard and soon returned with the empty blue package, sat down near the shed and started to fill the package with cartridges from his automatic weapon, and then this package with the cartridges was included in the protocol as found in the house of the Galaevs during searches. Also in the record of searches it was pretended that two automatic

¹ *Interfax-South, 27.09.2007.*

and other weapons were found in the house. Galaevs do not know where and under what circumstances the weapons were found - they said they did not have any weapons. They were not present at the searches. Tagir, immediately after he pulled out dead bodies in the street, was taken to the Malgobek's ROVD. After a while Fasimat Galaeva and her daughter in law Madina were also delivered there. Only-Said Ahmed remained in the yard. For a few hours he has seated near the corpses of his brothers until they were taken away by the militaries. A search of the house without respecting due rules of the process law took several hours.

The detainees were interrogated separately. The questioning was led by the investigator of prosecutor's Office **Adam Sultanovich Tsechoev**. During the questioning Fasimat expressed her outrage that her children were murdered without any fault. She asked: "Where is the power?" - "What power?" - The investigator replied, smiling - "because they offered armed resistance".

Tagir was asked from where there were weapons in the house, where he and his brothers were on the night of September 8 during the attack on the military unit № 3733, located on the outskirts of Malgobek, asked about the range of acquaintances of the brothers Galaev.

Meanwhile, near the Malgobek's ROVD up to one hundred of Galaevs' relatives and neighbours have gathered. They demanded the immediate release of detainees and promised not to disperse until their demands were met. At 19:00 Fasimat was released of the ROVD, at 22:00 — Tagir and a half an hour later - Madina.

On September 28 the bodies of the brothers were given to the Galaevs and buried the same day. According to the fellow villagers of Galaevs, the killed brothers had been never implicated to something illicit, they had an open mode of life, adhered to the traditional Islam, worked as builders on any private construction sites.

On November 16, a statement of the citizen **F. H. Galaeva** about misconduct of the law enforcement officials was transferred to the investigating office for the city of Malgobek of the Investigation Directorate of the Investigation Committee of the Prosecutor's Office of the Russian Federation for RI from the prosecutor's office of RI. A checking was conducted according to this statement. The checking established that *"the acts of the VOG MVD RF on Malgobek's district of RI and of the officers of OVD on Malgobek's district conducting searches in the household of Galaeva F.H. are admissible, no violations in their actions have been disclosed."*

On November 26, the investigator on the MVD investigation department for the city of Malgobek SU SK by the Prpsecutor's office of RF for RI, **A.A. Kurkiev** ruled on the refusal to institute criminal proceedings on the application of F. H. Galaevoy.

On September 28 Galaevs were given the bodies of the brothers, buried the same day.

According to people from the village of Galaevs, the killed brothers have been never implicated to something illicit, had an open mode of life, adhered to the traditional Islam, worked as builders on private construction sites.

On November 16, in the investigating office for the city of Malgobek of the Investigation Department of the Investigation Committee of the Prosecutor's Office of the Russian Federation for RI from the prosecutor's office of RI was transferred a statement of the citizen **F. H. Galaeva** about misconduct of the law enforcement officials. According to the statement has been carried out a checking during which it was established that *"the acts of the VOG MVD RF on Malgobek's district of RI and of the officers of OVD on Malgobek's district, conducted searches*

in the household of Galaeva F.H. are admissible, violations in their actions have not been disclosed. "

On November 26, the investigator on the MVD investigation department for the city of Malgobek SU SK by the Prosecutor's office of RF for RI, **A.A. Kurkiev** ruled on the refusal to institute criminal proceedings on the application of F. H. Galaeva.

Magomed Gandarov, lawyer representing the interests of F. H. Galaevoy, intends to appeal this decision in court.

Apti Dalakov, who was resident of the town of *Karabulak* in *Gradusov st.*, was assassinated in his home town on **September 2, 2007** at about 5:40 pm.

The media, quoting official sources, reported of a killing of a bandit in the course of a special operation. *"There was a special operation aimed at detaining persons involved in the recent crimes. One was killed, one was arrested"- said Moussa Medov, the Minister of the Interior of Ingushetia. "The one killed is a certain Apti Dalakov. At his age of 20, he, according to the investigation, was an active member of an armed gang. He had a defensive F-1 grenade with him". "In the town of Karabulak, in front of the building which used to be the "Ryabinka" kindergarten, Dalakov Apti, who had a grenade on him, offered armed resistance. As a result Dalakov was killed on the spot "- reported Pavel Belyakov, Deputy Public Prosecutor of the Republic of Ingushetia. -"His accomplice was a young man called Ilez Dolgiev. He has already given his testimony to the police. He is accused of participation in illegal armed groups "*

"According to the Public Prosecutor of Ingushetia Yuri Turygin, the arrested militant is suspected of involvement in the car bomb attack on the Zhiguli vehicle near the House of Culture in the centre of Nazran, on August 31, which resulted in four policemen being killed.<...>

According to the representative of the headquarters of the Temporary Military Forces in the republic, quoted by Interfax agency, the militant murdered as a result of a special operation in Karabulak "a certain Apti Dolgiev, born in 1986, a Wahhabism follower." "He is suspected of being a member of the terrorist group which is responsible for the murders of the Russian-speaking families, as well as for the wounding of two Dagestani shepherds" - claimed the source. According to his information, the arrested militant was a relative of the murdered."

The HRC Memorial has conducted its own enquiry and interviewed numerous eye-witnesses of the event. According to them, Apti Dalakov and his friends were leaving the computer room located next to the school-gymnasium at General Oskanov St. when two Gazel minibuses stopped near them - a white and a dark blue one, both without registration number plates and with tinted windows. Three dozen masked gunmen ran out of them, one or two of them were in civilian clothes. Seeing their firearms aimed at them, the young people, including those mentioned by the Deputy Public Prosecutor of RI Ilez Dolgiev, afraid and ran through courtyards of the blocks of flats in the direction of Dzhabagiev st. Witnesses say that following fleeing "siloviks" deliberately opened fire with automatic weapons "from knees." It was Sunday, and only by a happy accident of courtyards no one of the many women and children was hurt.

Apti Dalakov ran across Dzhabagiev St. and ran into the courtyard of the "Ryabinka" kindergarten inhabited by displaced persons from the *Prigorodny district* of the Republic South Ossetia-Alania. Here his persecutors caught up with him. According to the refugees, there were two of them: one in camouflage and a mask, the other - in civilian clothes and with an open face. One of them shouted at a woman looking at them: "Close the window" - and after that shots were heard. Apti fell face down. A man in civilian clothes approached him, pulled Apti's own T-shirt

on his face and shot several times from a pistol at the lying man and then made a "proof shot" in the head. After that he put some object in the hand of Dalakov. By that time the second group of perpetrators appeared on the scene having come from the other side of the kindergarten. According to the local police officers conducting further investigations, it turned out that this "object" was a hand-grenade.

Having heard the sound of shots the police officers and the officers of the republican OMON, whose base is located on the outskirts of Karabulak, also arrived to the kindergarten. They demanded the unidentified armed men to introduce themselves and tried to approach the body. In response they heard threats. Aiming weapons at the Ingush policemen, the unknown men shouted: *"Do not approach, you fags... or we shoot!"*. The confrontation did not last long: the unidentified men demanded additional forces on their portable radio and the man in civilian clothes ordered someone on the portable radio: *"Hide away the bag, otherwise the local policemen will soon arrive and there will be problems"*. An officer of the local police, who overheard this, believed that he was talking about the bag with the firearms, which they were going to plant on the murdered Aпти.

An angry crowd of locals had gathered near the kindergarten, calls to lynch the murderers were heard. Only the decisive actions of the Ingush policemen have to be thanked for the fact that the crowd was contained, even though with great difficulty. Despite the speedy arrival of the federal security service officers at the scene of the crime in "Ural" and UAZ vehicles and later in armored personnel carriers, the local policemen managed to disarm and take to the municipal department of internal affairs the direct perpetrators of the murder of Aпти Dalakov. According to the Karabulak police officers, the arrested refused to introduce themselves or explain the reasons for their actions. They were searched in the course of which FSB officers identity cards issued in other people's names were found on them: the four Russians had some Ingush names and the only Ingush had an Azeri name stated in their identity cards. Soon the senior officers of the UFSB for Ingushetia arrived to the municipal police department. They demanded release of the detained, the return of their firearms and the cartridge cases picked up at the scene of the murder, their demands were satisfied. Thus, it became impossible to check the firearms belonging to this group of FSB officers as to its possible use in other killings committed. Despite the resistance on the part of the officers of the Karabulak police, in the evening of the same day an order came from the Minister of Interior of Ingushetia to release the murderers.

The incident had its continuation during the Ingushetia visit of the Plenipotentiary Representative of the President of the Russian Federation in the Southern Federal District, Dmitry Kozak, on September 13. At a meeting in the capital of RI *Magas* Dmitry Kozak came down with harsh criticism against the Ministry of Interior of Ingushetia, which, in his opinion, was operating inefficiently, failing to coordinate its activities with the federal "siloviks", was unable to conduct proper work with the population and had supporters of militants, corruptionists and traitors among its ranks. The Plenipotentiary Representative particularly focused on the September 2 events in Karabulak. The cause of Kozak's outrage were not the unlawful acts of the FSB officers, but the fact that the ordinary policemen had the cheek to bring them to the municipal police department. The Plenipotentiary Representative demanded punishment for the policemen for basically just performing their professional duties, forbidding them to take any action against the arbitrariness of the unidentified people in civilian clothes. It remains unclear how then the policemen should have distinguished FSB officers from the militants. And could this be the reason for the recent successful acts of the latter on the streets of Ingushetia's settlements?

On September 8, at about 5 a.m. officers of the Ministry of Interior of the Republic of Ingushetia detained **Murad Abdul-Kadyrovich Bogatyryov**, born in 1970, living in a small

ready-made house on *Beckov St.* in the village of *Verkhniye Achaluki*. The "siloviks" broke into the house and took Murad away delivering him to the district Department of Internal Affairs of the Malgobeksky district. The premises and the adjacent territory were searched in the presence of Bogatyryov's father and the attesting witnesses, nothing illegal was found - the protocol of search states that only the mobile phone and the SIM card were seized.

At 8 a.m. the relatives who were standing outside the police building, saw the naked dead body of Bogatyryov being taken out. The wife of the murdered was told that Murad died of a heart attack. The body was not returned to the family, the officers stated that it would be taken to the Bureau of Forensic Expertise of the Russian Ministry of Health.

A few hours later the wife of Bogatyryov returned home and saw that the "siloviks" were again conducting a search in the house. One of them became agitated asking why she came. The wife of Bogatyryov offered them a key from the trailer. The key was not accepted as they refused to go into the trailer saying that they wanted to search the yard instead. According to the operational summary report of the Ministry of Interior of the Republic of Ingushetia, during the repeated search PK cartridges 7.62 mm - 1,092 pieces, AK cartridges 7.62 mm - 37 pcs. To AK, 5.45 mm - 85 pcs, to PM - 9 mm - 38 pcs, grenade RPG-5 - 1 pc., magazine case of AK with 30 cartridge of 5.45 mm. A criminal case was opened pursuant to Article 317 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation (Encroachment on the Life of an Officer of a Law-enforcement Agency), Para.2 of Article 222 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation (Illegal Acquisition, Transfer, Sale, Storage, Transportation, or Bearing of Firearms, Its Basic Parts, Ammunition, Explosives, and Explosive Devices). The relatives did not receive a copy of the protocol of the search, they have not seen the attesting witnesses either.

On September 9, 2007 on the Television Channel 5, the "Now" news block reported that Bogatyryov who was arrested on suspicion of attacking a military base in *Malgobek* on September 5, died in detention of a heart failure. It was claimed that he had been an active participant of the illegal armed formations and that he was in charge of the financial support of the militants.

.According to the wife of the murdered Bogatyryov, numerous witnesses - relatives and neighbors - can confirm that at the time of the attack on the military base Murat was not in Malgobek at all but visiting his parents in Nazran. The body of Bogatyryov, taken away from the morgue by his relatives, bore numerous traces of beatings, which was certified on a video and photo tape.

With regard to the death of Bogatyryov inside the police building in the city of Malgobek the Department of Investigation initiated criminal case No 07540061 pursuant to Article 286 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation (exceeding official powers). The forensic expertise confirms that the body of Bogatyryov bore signs of injuries of moderate severity. Bogatyryov never suffered from any heart-related diseases and never took any related medication, no complaints were heard from him in this regard on the eve of his detention either.

By virtue of a decree dated December 31, 2007, the special investigator, Junior Counselor of Justice, M.T. Dzeytov, suspended the investigation of the criminal case No 07540061 due to not-establishment of the person to be charged with committing this crime.

In mid-January 2008, the Prosecutor's Office of the city of Malgobek resumed its investigation of this criminal case.

The interests of the widow of Bogatyryov are represented by a lawyer invited by the Memorial.

On October 9, at about 22.20, *in the town of Malgobek*, not far from his own house, was killed a local resident **Albert Magomedovich Gorbakov**, born in 1985, resided at 28, Alhanchurtskaya street.

In the evening on that day as relatives of Albert Gorbakov said, the head of the family Magomed Gorbakov and his sons, Albert and **Shamil**, born in 1986 and **Kaloy**, born in 1994 went out to search the herds of sheep that have not returned home. Albert and Shamil went along by a car **VAZ-21099**, blue metallic color (registration number V833SS, the 15th Region). At about 21.00 they returned home. Albert dropped Shamil out of the car and went to look for sheep alone. Other members of the family Gorbakov stayed home.

After 22.00 the lady **Pyatimat** heard the shooting, but she didn't pay attention to it. However, shooting started again shortly. Shot not far from home Gorbakovykh, 200 - 250 meters, near the irrigation canal. At the sound of shooting on the street came out a lot of people. Shooting lasted about 15 minutes while they were accompanied by loud voices and screaming as if someone fought between them. There were visible traces of tracer bullets.

Officers of local and federal security services started to arrive to the scene by armored personal carriers. After a while officers began to comb the area nearby the canal and moved to the Alhanchurtskaya street. People stood in the street rushed back to the house. 20 - 25 minutes later after the shooting stopped, the siloviks blocked the yard of Gorbakovs', highlighting the house with searchlights. Through a loudspeaker the owner was ordered to go out into the street.

Magomed Gorbakov went out to the balcony. He was ordered to withdraw all the men on the street, and to leave women on the balcony. Gorbakov complied with the order. He went out into the street along with two sons. The siloviks immediately took Kaloy and Shamil and took them into the building of Malgobek's ROVD (Promyshlennaya Str.). The brothers Gorbakov had been questioned. The interrogation was conducted by a masked man that failed to identify himself. The brothers were asked where they had been on that day, demanding they to sign the testimonies that they provided armed resistance during detention. Shamil and Kaloy refused to sign such testimonies. The brothers Gorbakov were brought to the magistrate **Mikhail Dzeytov**, which made them an administrative penalty, arresting for 3 days. The brothers did not know the exact reason for their arrest (according to the official information, they were arrested for an administrative violation under the Art 19.3. of the Administrative Code of RF). Later, after the Gorbakov's house was searched, Gorbakov Magomed was brought to the ROVD. The reason for his detention was a car «Volkswagen», which the family Gorbakov bought recently but did not complete the formalities in order to obtain the documents for the new owner correctly. The searches were conducted on the ruling of the investigative department for the city of Malgobek by the Prosecutor's Office of Russia. When the Investigation Directorate of the Investigation Department by the Russian Prosecutor's office. This search was recognized as legitimate and justified by the ruling of the Malgobeks's City from 11.10.2007.

Being on the territory of ROVD, at about 2.00, Magomed saw that their car VAZ-21099, by which Albert left, brought to the site. The car was riddled with bullets. It was brought to the ROVD in tow by an armored personnel carrier. At that time, Magomed still knew nothing about the fate of his son Albert.

At 5.00 Magomed was released. He learned from relatives of his wife that Albert had been killed.

In the afternoon of **October 10**, the corpse of Albert Gorbakov was given to his relatives. They took away his body from the morgue where an autopsy was performed on it. The body of Albert was the only bullet hole in the chest, the bullet went to flight.

According to the Prosecution of RI Gorbakov was killed while resisting to the police: «Police officers, noticing at the side of the carriageway of Albogachiev St. a car VAZ -21099, attempted to check the papers of people that were there. The men being in the car offered opened fire on three policemen and tried to escape. One of the men that provide armed resistance, Albert Magometovich Gorbakov, born in 1985, was killed with response fire. The other two men, whose identity was not established, fled the scene. The police officers were not affected. An improvised explosive device of directional operation, an elektrodetonator and other physical evidence that were in VAZ-21099 were seized at the scene. The Investigation Department on the city of Malgobek of the Investigation Department of the Investigations Committee by the Russian Prosecutor's office in the Republic of Ingushetia instituted criminal proceedings on this fact on grounds of crimes under Article 317, paragraph 2 of the Article 222 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation (attempt on the life of law enforcement authority, illegal acquisition, storage, carrying a firearm) ».

According to the information obtained from other sources, Gorbakov and people were with him in the car did not provide any armed resistance, but they were fired after they went out of the car. Gorbakov Albert was the 5th year student at the Faculty of Law at Ingush State University, before he was graduated in law in Nazran's College.

On January 30, 2008, after 19.00, on the outskirts of the village of *Surkhakhi* officers of Russian security services killed two local residents: **Dzhabrail Mukharbekovich Mutsolgov**, born in 1983, resided at that time in Surkhakhi, 81, Nagornaya St., (registered at the address: Nazran city, 7, Bazorkin prosp., Apt. 23) and **Ramazan Makhmudovich Nalgiev**, born in 1984, resided at 8, *Nalgiev St.*

According to eyewitnesses, Mutsolgov and Nalgiev were carried by a car VAZ-21012 (hatchback) belonging to Mutsolgov. When they arrived to Surkhakhi the Mutsolgov's car was overtaken by two cars - VAZ-2107 and a minibus «Gazelle». VAZ-2107 traveled forward and stopped at filling station. «Gazelle» came up with Mutsolgov's car, which carried Mutsolgov and Nalgiev an opened heavy fire. Mutsolgov and Nalgiev were killed, their car pulled in to the ditch. A few minutes later, several armored personnel carriers, several cars UAZ and minibuses «Gazelle», carrying officers of security forces arrived to the scene. They cordoned the area, blocked the road and began to search the shot car. Nobody was allowed to approach the area of special operation including officers of the republican security structures. «Siloviks» dragged the murdered out of the car. After some tome the car was blew up.

According to the Prosecution of RI: *«On January 30, 2008, in the framework of the counter-terrorist operation two wanted members of IAGs, Nalgiev R. and Mutsolgov D. who have been involved in the commission of a number of subversive and terrorist acts committed on the territory of the Republic of Ingushetia, were destroyed on the road «Ekazhevo - Surhahi». The initial investive actions, namely the inspection of the scene, during which a large quantity of firearms and ammunition was discovered and seized, were carried out with the participation of the Prosecutor of Nazran's district».*

.According to relatives, Dzhabrail Mutsolgov was not wanted. From November 2005 to August 2007 he worked at the Pension Fund of the Republic of Ingustetia. In August 2007, he left for Moscow for training (professional development). He returned from Moscow on January

24 for the wedding of his brother. On January 25, he bought a car VAZ-21012, as the brother's car was in a damaged condition.

Ramzan Nalgiev also kept an open mode of life, did not hide from anyone and was not wanted. He worked in a commercial company that manufactures and established false ceilings. The relatives of Mutsolgov suggest that the killing of Dzhabrail and Ramzan is linked in any way with the car, which Dzhabrail acquired. The local law enforcement officials told them that the car was seen at the time of firing the central post office and «an orientation» could be given to this car.

The bodies of the killed were given to the relatives for burial.

On February 1, 2008, after 13-00,

1 February 2008, after 13.00, in the city of Nazran in the prospect Bazorkin, near the monument to the participants Russia's Great Patriotic War participants in the power structures killed a local resident **Yusup Amirovich Chapanov**, born in 1986, resided on the Mashinostroiteli street., 10 / 2.

One of the brothers of Yusup Chapanov, **Musa Chapanov**, was being not far from this place at the time of the special operation. He's a guard at the store «Berkat». After he heard shots, Musa went in the direction of the monument to the participants of Russia's Great Patriotic War. This place was cordoned by officers of the security structures on the perimeter. There were also military vehicles: armored personnel carriers, the car «Ural», several armored cars UAZ and other machines. Nobody was allowed in the area of closures. Musa saw the body of the murdered man from a distance of 40 - 50 meters. He identified his brother, Yusup, according to the clothes. An officer of the security services has been next to the corpse for a while. He was doing something, but it was not possible to see, what exactly. Once the officer has gone away from the corpse, another policeman came and took a pistol from the victim's chest. He put the arm in a plastic bag. Moussa called his elder brother Bashir and told him about the murder of Yusup. Arrived to the scene, Bashir learned from eyewitnesses that Yusup was killed by armed men carried by a car VAZ-21014, silver color. The killers first shouted to Yusup: «Stop», and when Yusup looked back to the cry, they shot him at point-blank range with automatic weapons by a few single shots. Then, they made a control shot in the head of the killed Yusup.

«Siloviks» took the corpse of the killed away and delivered to the morgue of the central hospital of Nazran. Officers of local law enforcement agencies and prosecutors arrived to the scene of murder. They told to the relatives of the murdered, where the corpse was. The members of the family Chapanov went to the hospital and took the body of Yusup away. At about 14.00 officers of Russian federal and local security services carried by armored personnel carriers, cars «Ural», cars UAZ and other vehicles, arrived to the family Chapanov's house. About 30 people entered the house. Some of them were masked. Several people were dressed in civilian clothes, other in uniform. They did neither present themselves nor present any documents. The unauthorized searches were made in house. Nothing illegal was found the search. During the search «siloviks» behaved brutally, overturned furniture and threw the belongings. After the search was finished, no documents were completed.

On the same day, the Prosecutor's office of RI spread the following message: *«On February 1, 2008, in the course of the special operation carried out in the framework of the counter-terrorist operation in the city of Nazran, Chapanov Yu, member of an illegal armed group, was destroyed at his detention.»*

The initial investigative actions were carried out. During the inspection a pistol of the system «TT» with a spare magazine was discovered on the scene and seized. The Investigation Directorate of the Investigation Committee by the Russian prosecutor's office on the Republic of Ingushetia instituted a criminal case on the fact of the grounds of the crimes specified by the Article 317 (attempt on life of the law enforcement authority) and a part of the Article 222 (illegal acquisition, transfer, sale, storage, transportation or carrying of arms). Its main parts, ammunition, explosives and explosive devices) of the Criminal Code of RF. Currently, the operational and investigative actions are carried out ».

On February 1, the brother of the murdered, Bashir Chapanov, appealed to the office of the HRC «Memorial» in Nazran with a written statement. Bashir Chapanov asked for assistance in identifying persons that perpetrated the killing of Yusup. According to Bashir, Yusup was not wanted or subjected to the criminal responsibility. He studied at the Faculty of correspondence of Ingush University. He worked as a guard at the store «Berkat». On the day of the murder he was returning from the Friday prayers from the central mosque of Nazran.

One of the brothers Chapanov, **Idris Chapanov**, born in 1971, has been wanted for already three years on suspicion of participation in armed attack on officers of law enforcement agencies committed by a large illegal armed group on the night of 22 June 2004. His whereabouts is unknown to the relatives.

On February 4, 2008 Hutieva Tamara Tagirovna, resident of the city of Karabulak, living on 31, Komarov St. appealed to the office of HRC «Memorial» with a written statement. According to Hutieva, **on 31 January, 2008** in the city of Chegem (Kabardino-Balkaria) officers of unidentified security services abducted her son **Daud Umaevich Hutiev**, born in 1985, from a hospital.

On November 2, 2007 after receiving severe injuries in an road accident, **Daud Hutiev** was hospitalized in Chegems's City Hospital, where he stayed until he was abducted. **On January 31**, Daud met a visitor, a young man who was earlier in the same chamber in hospital with Hutiev until he was discharged. After 20.00, Daud went to go to the door with the guest. At the reception department 7 men attacked them. Two were dressed in police uniform and others in civilian clothes. Daud and his guest was knocked down to the ground, searched and then taken away from the hospital. The Daud's guest was released on the street and Hutiev put in a car and driven away to an unknown destination.

As of **May 31, 2008**, relatives of the abducted had no information on thw whereabouts of Daud. According to the mother, her son did not commit any illegal acts, and sports was his unique only passion in the life.

In her statement Tamara Hutieva asks for assistance in the search of her son.

On March 12, 2008, at about 15.30 in the stanitsa Troitskaya, in the course of targeted special operation, officers of UFSB for RI together with officers of another law enforcement bodies of Russia killed a local resident **Rustam Magomedovich Mutsolgov**, born in 1986, lived with his family (mother, sister, wife and child) on Krasina street., 24.

The agency «Interfax» reported: *«the operational headquarters in the Republic of Ingushetia announced the conduction of a counter-terrorist operation in stanitsa Troitskaya of Sunzhensky district at 15 o'clock on March 12. The distributed by operational headquarters press release states that «in the law enforcement agencies there is information that members of band group are hiding in the stanitsa Troitskaya and they intend to commit a number of terrorist*

acts on the territory of the Republic of Ingushetia ». The counter-terrorist operation is carried out in order to eliminate the threat of terrorist acts, in keeping with the rules of the Federal Law of Russia № 35 of 6 March 2006 «On the counteraction against terrorism».

According to eyewitnesses, after 15.00, military convoy, consisting of 2 armored personnel carriers, several minibuses «Gazelle» and armored cars UAZ arrived to the Krasin from both two sides. A large number of officers of the security structures cordoned off the house number 24. At that time, Rustam Mutsolgov was in the courtyard of the house; his sister **Zarema** and her child were inside the house. Seeing a large number of military officers, Rustam was afraid and ran toward the river adjacent to the house. The neighbors heard the military officers shouting to him: «Stop, we will shoot!». Then several bursts of automatic weapons' fire and a muffled explosion were heard. Firing were the officers who kept the cordon. Rustam was killed on the on the riverside.

According to the press service of UFSB on RI, during the special operatio Mutsolgov offered armed resistance, opening fire on a group of siloviks with firearms. During the fighting he tried to activate a grenade, which exploded in his hands, and he was fatally wounded.

Similarly, it was reported that members of law enforcement bodies was detained the brother of Rustam's wife, **Aushev**, who came to the stanitsa Troitskaya, once he learned that the house of his son-in-law was blocked by the military officers. He was detained when he tried to pass through the cordon.

On the same day the body of the killed was handed to the relatives for funerals. The funerals of Rustam Mutsolgov took place on **March 13**, in the village of Surhahi.

According to the relatives, Rustam was not wanted and did not hide from anybody. The family Mutsolgov moved to the stanitsa Troitskaya about a year ago. Until that time they lived in the city of Karabulak. Mutsolgov was graduated in law in a professional college. Until August 7 Rustam has worked ass monitor of the human rights organization "MASHR". Last summer he married.

The last time Rustam worked on private constructions.

The older brother of the murdered, **Zaur Mutsolgov**, is condemned for 25 years of prison on the accusation of attack against law enforcers in the night of June 22, 2007 (condemned of August 13, 2005 by the Supreme Court of Ingushetia).

The sister of Zarem was a wife of **Ibragim (Adam) Gardanov**, killed by law enforcement officers on February 7, 2007 in the city of Nazran together with **Magomed Chakhkiev** (*see information from February 7, 2007*).

On 8 May, 2008, at about 8.30 in the stanitsa of Kantyshevo officers of UFSB on Ingushetia killed a local resident **Issa Ashabovich Arsaev**, born in 1985, resided on 18, Pushkin street.

On the same day, the press service of UFSB on Ingushetia issued a press release, which stated that the killed resident of Ingushetia was a member of IAGs: «On May 8, 2008, at 8:30 a .m. in the village of Kantyshevo of Nazran's district officers of law enforcement agencies of Ingushetia carried out an operative-battle activities in order to detain a member of the so-called "Zavodky" band group of Arsaev Isa Ashabovich, born on 17.12.85. This group was involved in the commission of a number of drastic subversive and terrorist acts in Ingushetia, including firing and killing of law enforcement officers. During the arrest the bandit offered armed

resistance and was injured and as a result of retaliatory fire, the injury being incompatible with life. According to the available information, the members of the band group planned to perpetrate the commission in Ingushetia of subversive and terrorist acts during public events liked with the celebration on the Victory Day (March 9 in Russia).

On May 12, 2008 activists of the HRC «Memorial» met with Arsaev's relatives. They gave some details of the special operation, during which Isa was killed. On May 8, at about 8.25, Isa left home for work and was going to Nazran. Issa worked as a programmer in the private enterprise «Spektr» («Spektr Ltd» makes tax accounting and processing documents for opening new societies). As Arsaev approached a bus station on Kabardinskaya St, any armed persons dressed in camouflage uniforms shouted to him: «Stop!». Surprised, Issa made a few steps back. At that time a fire to kill was opened on him from all the sides. Issa received 8 injuries and died on-site as a result. The killing of Arsaev was witnessed by several local residents. They said that officers of security services had taken up their positions on Kabardinskaya street since about 8 o'clock in the morning. They came by two armored personal carriers ah, two minibuses «Gazelle» dark blue, and several cars UAZ. All the vehicles had no registration plates. Eyewitnesses claim that Issa did not offer any armed resistance. According to the Arsaev's mother, Issa never had any weapons. On that day he was dressed in jeans, T-shirt and athin windcheater. Parents accompanied him to the gate, and if he had carried a pistol and two grenades, they would have sure noticed it. People resided on Kabardinskaya street saw that two officers of the special police unit (Spetsnaz) came to Issa's body. One of them put rubber gloves on his hands, pulled out a pistol with a silencer from his belt, made two shots into the air and put a pistol next to the Arsaev's body. Officers of the security structures took photos and put video of the killed. After that the FSB officers walked around the adjacent to the site of the operation housing estates and wrote down the passport details of all their inhabitants. In doing so, they did not introduce themselves or explain any reason for writing down the passport details. After a while, the "siloviks" have left, and officers members of the republican police and prosecutors were admitted to visit the site. The Arsaev's corpse was delivered to the morgue of the city of Nazran, and on the same day was given out to relatives from there. It should be noted that witnesses of the murder of Issa Arsaev refused to give any official testimony on the case, fearing for their safety.

On May 13, the office of the HRC «Memorial» in the city of Nazran received a written statement from the mother of Isa Arsaev, **Lidiya Arsaeva**. She affirmed that her son was killed without any justification. According to her words, Isa worked and studied by correspondence at the Ingush University of accounting and audit. He went in for sports, offered prayer on time, visited a mosque. He was not wanted and no criminal proceedings were instituted against him by the police. The Arsaev's house had been never searched. Parents, neighbors and acquaintances of Isa Arsaev do not believe that he could be a member of IAGs or could have to do the preparation of a terrorist attack. Isa was very communicable and was in full view of people.

After the murder of Arsaev law enforcers did not visit his parents, and as of July 1, 2008 no investigative activities were conducted in the house of Arsaev, his relatives were not questioned.

According to the announcement of the Prosecutor's Office of RI on 8.05.08 Nazran's interregional Investigations Department of the Investigation Directorate by the the Russian prosecutor's office in the Republic of Ingushetia instituted a criminal case under the article 317 and the paragraph 1 of the article 222 of the Criminal Code of Russia:

«In the village of Kantyshevo of Nazran's district of the republic of Ingushetia a member of an illegal armed group was destroyed.

On 8 May, 2008 in the village of Kantyshevo of Nazran's district of the republic of Ingushetia law enforcement officials carrying out operational-search activities in order to locate and detain members of illegal armed groups destroyed a members of IAGs I Arsaev, while he offered armed resistance during his detention.

With the participation of the prosecutor of Nazran's district the scene was inspected, a pistol with a device for silent shooting, an improvised explosive device the so called «hattabka» and a hand grenade were discovered and confiscated.

On this fact the Nazran's Interdistrict Investigation Department of the Investigation Directorate of the Investigation Committee by the prosecutor's office of Russia on the Republic of Ingushetia instituted a criminal case under the article 317 and the paragraph 1 of the article 222 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation ».

The Relatives of Isa Arsaev intend to press the investigation, obtain the detection and prosecution of persons involved in the killing of Isa.

On June 3, 2008, at 19:30, on the outskirts of Yandare officers of UFSB on RI conducting a special action in order to detain an alleged participant of IAGs killed one person and injured and beat another one, that and later died in hospital.

According to the press service UFSB on RI: *On June 3 2008, at 19 and a half o'clock , to south-west from the village of Yandare of Nazran's district of RI, an operative-battle action to detain the bandits carried by the car «Chevrolet-Niva» took place. In the course of the event a fire with automatic weapons was opened on the special vehicles of law enforcement officers. As a result of retaliatory fire siloviks one of sooting persons was injured. His injurie was incompatible with life. The car came under fire. Another participant of an IAG tried to escape but he was moderately injured and arrested. His identity was established. He was Ozdoev Mikail Lakhanovich, born on 30.12.1984 in the city of Nazran of Chechen-Ingush autonomous region (CHIASSR) and registered at the address: RI, the city of Nazran, 27, Tsoroeva St. A Kalashnikov submachine gun, a Makarov pistol of caliber 7.62 and a large quantity of burnt ammunition and the corpse of a member of the IAG were found in the burnt car. The detainee Ozdoev M. K. in the course of the urgent investigation-operative activities had agreed to cooperate with the investigation. In particular, he identified the second member of an IAG as **Tsuroev Rezvan Isaevich**, born in 1985 in the city of Nazran of CHIASSR, registered at the address: RI, the city of Nazran, m/o Nasyr-Kortsky, 10, Kosmichesky side street. According to the preliminary information the above mentionned bandits are involved in the commission of a series resonant subversive and terrorist acts in the republic, including the targeting and killing law enforcement officers.*

On June 9 the relatives of Mikhail Ozdoev applied to the office of HRC «Memorial» - father and brother **Lakhan** and **Hassan Ozdoev**. They argue that Mikail was not a participant of IAGs, and in he was in the car together with Tsuroev accidentally.

According to their version, on June 3, Mikail Ozdoev left house to go to the village of Yandare to visit his cousin. At the bus station of Nazran, where Mikail was waiting a bus, he was recognized by an acquaintance, Rezvan Tsuroev (before Mikail made a toning of his car). Tsuroev proposed Mikail to bring him to his car «Chevrolet-Niva», as he was also going to Yandare. Mikhail agreed.

In the village of Yandare Tsuroev dropped Ozdoev off in a street and asked him to wait until he visited his relatives residing on the outskirts of the village. Shortly Tsuroev was back and Mikhail got into his car again. They were going to go to relatives of Ozdoev.

After having made a short distance they saw two armoured personnel carriers on the hill. When the Tsuroev's car arrived to them at a distance of about 50 meters at the car came under fire with automatic weapons. Tsuroev was fatally injured. The car lost control, banged into pole and overturned. Ozdoev got out of the car and tried to run aside to a nearby garden. People from armored personnel carriers opened fire on him. Ozdoev was injured in the thigh. The bullet went right through the pelvis. Ozdoev fell in the garden of the housing belonging to the family Kostoev. Immediately this place was blocked by a large number of officers of federal security services. Injured, Ozdoev was severely beaten with feet and rifle butts. He was accused of having allegedly opened retaliatory fire. Mikhail tried to explain them that he was not guilty of anything, proposed to take his hands' wash and fingerprints. Siloviki would not listen to him. Ozdoev was take off his outwear and continued to beat him. "Siloviks" burt the Tsuroev's car shooting with a shot grenade launcher (Ozdoev heard, as one military ordered to burn the car). More than two hours Ozdoev lay on the ground, bleeding. During that time he was not given any medical assistance. Officers of local security services were not allowed to approach the area of the special operation. However, when officers of the federal security services tried to take Ozdoev away by an armored personnel carrier, the Ingush policemen insisted that the injured Ozdoev would be brought to the hospital by an ambulance. Ozdoev was brought to the Central District Hospital and performed surgery. Apart from gunshot injury, he was repelled kidneys and intestines. Ozdoev was taken to a hospital room under guard.

On June 4 in the Ozdoev's house residing in Altievsky micro district of the city of Nazran on 27, Tsuroev street officers of the republican law enforcement bodies together with federal law enforcement bodies conducted searches. The inspection of the premises itself was made by Ingush "siloviks". Nothing illegal was found during the searches.

According to the Ministry of the Interior of RI, on the same day a search was conducted also in Tsuroev Rezvan's house. The searches were conducted in the framework of the investigation of a criminal case instituted on the fact of the armed resistance to law enforcement officials. In a private house, located in the municipality of Nasyr-Kortsky of the city of Nazran, where Tsuroev was killed, 96 bullets caliber 7.62 mm, 5 mobile phones, camouflage uniform, handle of a anti-tank grenades flare pistol and two plastic bags of gunpowder were found during the search and removed .

A criminal case instituted on grounds of crimes under Articles 317 and the part 1 of article 222 of the Criminal Code of Russia, is conducting by the Investigation Department for the city of Nazran of the Investigations Directorate of the Investigation Committee by the Russian prosecutor's office on the republic of Ingushetia.

On June 10 relatives of Mikhail Ozdoev hired a lawyer Madina Dahkilgova to protect his interests. On June 11 Ozdoev Mikhail died in the hospital. The family Ozdoev intend to pursue prosecution of the officers of the security services responsible for the death of Mikhail.

On 11 Jun., 2008, at around 5:30 in the city of Karabulak officers of UFSB for RI conducted a special operation to detain persons suspected of involvement in the IAGs. On the same day the operational headquarters in the Republic of Ingushetia diffused the official message: «In order to suppress the subversive and terrorist acts and minimize their impact by the decision of operational headquarters in the Republic of Ingushetia there was conducted a counter-terrorist operation using the combined forces of law enforcement agencies stationed in Ingushetia from 5:00 pm 11.06.2008 year in the city of Karabulak in a residential area limited by streets Dzhabagiev - Ochyabrskaya - Bochalov – Komarov streets. As a result of fighting five terrorists received injuries incompatible with life. Given that there are currently no threat to life, health, property or other legally protected interests of the inhabitants of the Republic of Ingushetia, in accordance with the requirements of the Federal Law of March 6, 2006 number 35-FZ «against terrorism», the operational headquarters decided: the counter-terrorist operation

carried out on 11.06.2008 in the city of Karabulak is considered as completed. The Introduced in the territory of the Republic of Ingushetia during the counterterrorist operation measures and temporary restrictions are cancelled. The Law enforcement agencies have been transferred into normal duty».

According to the information of the HRC «Memorial» at about 5:30 a.m. in Karabulak officers of security services blocked the housing located at 21, Oskanov St. There were **Lydia Besultanovna Albakova**, born in 1954, and her son **Adam Isaevich Hadzhaev**, born in 1982 living at that address. In addition they were another three people in the house. The people arrived in the evening before to visit **Adam Hadzhaev** and stayed to sleep.

People living next door to the house number 21 said that they did not know the details of the assault of the Albakova's house because they were not able to go into the street. According to them, there were a very large number of servicemen (over 200 people) and vehicles (including armored ones) in the area of Oskanov and adjacent streets. The firing has lasted for more than 2 hours. At about 8:30 the special operation was finished.

Neighbors describe Lydia Albakova and her son Adam only positively. They doubt that Lydia Albakova and her son may have been involved in a terrorist organization.

However, the official security agencies argue that people who were in the house, had provided armed resistance with automatic weapons. Retaliatory fire opened by siloviks destroyed everyone who was in the house. There were the house owner **Lydia Albakova**, her son **Adam Hadzhaev**, as well as three people, stayed with them overnight - resident of the city of Nazran **Musa Hasanovich Pugoev**, born in 1983, resident of the stanitsa Ordzhonikidzevskaya, **Movled Hadzhibikarovich Merzhoev**, born in 1983 and the body of the fifth man allegedly belonged to **Mukharbek Salingireevich Aushev**, born in 1976.

The house is completely destroyed. There were three AKM assault rifles, a hand Kalashnikov machinegun, Stechkina Makarova pistols and two sets of plate with car's State registration numbers of the 15th and 163th regions were found at the scene. The removed weapons were sent to the expert forensic investigation.

On this fact the criminal case under articles 317 (attempt on life of law enforcement officers) and 222 (illegal possession and carrying of weapons), of the Criminal Code of Russia is instituted.

According to the preliminary investigation of the criminal case, the killed people are suspected of involvement in the following crimes: firing of officers of UFSB of Russia for RI in the village of Surhahi on 23.04.2008, firing of district commissioners of the OVD on Sunzhensky district area Gazdiev Kh.B. and Ugurchiev R.A. in the stanitsa Ordzhonikidzevskaya on 23.02.2008, firing of soldiers Klyuchniko A. A. and Gadaborshev M.B. in the stanitsa Troitskaya on 23.01.2008, killing of the officer of OVD on Sunzhensky district Araphanov S.I. on 14.11.2007, firing of the officers OVD on Sunzhensky district Evloev M.M-G. and Khamhoev B.M. in the stanitsa Ordzhonikidzevskaya on 07.11.2007, killing of the workers of «NEON» close corporation Oskin V.N., Butusov S.A., Ponomarev V.B. and wounding of Toschak A.D. in the area of the village of Yandare on 04.11.2007 city, firing of officers of **PPSM** of the Chechen republic in the yard of Sunzhensky district's Central Hospital on 10.10.2007, killing of the officer of OVD on Sunzhensky district Meyriev A.Ya. on 18.09.2007; firing of Kamberdiev S.U. on the road «Magas-Ekazhevo» on 24.08.2006.

A few years ago Lydia Albakova retired. Before that, she taught Russian and English languages at the school. Already retired Lydia Albakova made tutoring. Her son, Adam Hadzhaev, was graduated from the school number 2 in Karabulak, has already served in the army. He lived together with his mother, had no permanent job. Perhaps he was familiar with one of the guests of his house.

On August 2, in Plievsky municipality of the city of Nazran officers of federal power structures killed two local residents **Khamzat Izmailovich Gardanov**, born in 1978, resided at 39, Gorchkhanov street, and **Daoud Magomedovich Chibiev**, born in 1982, resided at 21, Murzabekov street.

On that day, at about 13:00 in Plievsky municipality of the city of Nazran at the intersection of Oskanov and Kotiev streets unidentified people carried by a car «VAZ-21114» silver color, fired on a car VAZ-21112, carrying officers of the Russian Federation Ministry of the Interior: police lieutenant colonel **Alexander Panteleev**, 36 years old and the police lieutenant **Alexander Martov**, 26 years old. As a result, both police officers were injured and hospitalized. The attackers fled the scene.

The scene of the attack and adjacent streets were blocked by officers of federal security services and Ingush police officers. Passage on the main Oskanov street was blocked. About an hour later, after 14:00 in a car «BMW» arrived to the cordoned area, carrying two local residents, **Khamzat Gardanov** and his cousin **Daoud Chibiev**. They were returning from Nazran, where they went to buy paint for the car. Their car freely passed the post with the Ingush policemen and was stopped by officers of federal security services in Sholokhov street. (100 meters from the main Oskanov street). One officer talked to the driver Chibiev, after that the BMW went further. At that time, one of the siloviks yelled something and opened fire on the care with an automatic weapon.

Gardanov and Chibiev jumped out of the car and tried to escape. A heavy fire to kill was open following them, including with a manual machine gun mounted on the car UAZ. Gardanov received fatal injuries and died at the scene. Chibiev, according to witnesses, was injured but managed to escape into a nearby garden belonging to a local resident Vedzizhev. In addition siloviks had fired nearby gardens for some time (about 2 hours). The fire was chaotic, and so heavy that most of the corn in the garden was mowed down with bursts of machine-gun fire.

Also the siloviks used armored personnel carriers to search for the escapee. They drove into the gardens bringing down a fence. However, Chibiev was not found.

Local residents were afraid to go from their homes during that time, fearing caught fire were opened by officers of security forces. Many witnesses of this incident claimi that Gardanov and Chibiev did not provide any armed resistance.

Officers planted a gun on the killed Gardanov (after making shots with it) and three chargers. People who saw it are afraid to give any official testimony and reported about that only to Gardanov's relatives.

On the same day the body of Khamzata was given to relatives for burial. Officers of the Prosecutor's office of RI being to travel to the scene suggested to the relatives of the murdered to conduct a forensic medicine examination, to remove bullets from the body for subsequent ballistics. During the examination of Gardanov's body the bullets were not be found, as they went right through.

The next day, in the morning of August 3, the body of the murdered Daoud Chibiev was found in one of the gardens not far from Sholokhov street.

According to the headquarters of the Temporary forces, Gardanov and Chibiev were killed after they refused to leave the protected zone. The military prosecutor's office is conducting an inspection on the legality of the use of weapons against two BMW passengers.

During the special operation in the city of Malgobek on February 3, 2007 killed were **Gatagazhev Ramzan Umarovich**, born in 1985, and **Khaniev Timur Abdul-Salamovich**, born in 1981, during the special operation on March 11, 2007 in the stanitsa of Ordzhonikidzevskaya killed were (auto-explosion) two residents of Chechnya **Apti Said-Magomedovich Yukhigov**, born in 1965 and **Raisa Zakieva** (according to the operative reports of the Ministry of the Interior of RI, the identity of women was not established). **Hussein Magomedovich Mutsolgov**, born in 1986, died in a room of Malgobek's GOVD three hours after his arrest on September 8, 2007. **Ahmed Muhamedovich Kartoev**, born in 1977, and **Ibrahim Muhamedovich Gazdiev**, born in 1978.